A Clinical Health Care Student Exploration of the Global Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health

Summary
Using content from international health and climate assessments, participants are tasked with describing the impacts of changing climatic conditions on human health with emphasis on vulnerable populations and patients. Participants will then apply systems thinking to create a visual model that depicts the relationships between climate change and human health. Participants apply knowledge gained from the reports and clinical correlations to make connections to their own practice and are then prompted to consider the co-benefits of climate mitigation and to identify and evaluate adaptation strategies that are protective of human health. To connect with the larger community of climate and health practice, participants are invited to explore regional or global data to understand existing climate adaptation and mitigation strategies and engage with regional efforts to implement interventions.

Audience
This module is intended for international students in healthcare related degree programs [Medicine, Physician’s Assistant, Nursing etc.] and clinical healthcare professionals interested in learning about the health impacts of climate change. Instructors may be professional educators or informed health professionals, or health professions students interested in sharing knowledge with teams, students and peers.

Settings
This module is a versatile tool that can be implemented in various educational and professional settings such as:

- Medical school applied science curriculum
- Public health school applied science curriculum
- Medical and public health special interest group meetings or elective opportunities
- Graduate medical education didactic conferences
- Professional “brown bag” style meetings
- Professional conferences

Learning Objectives
By the end of this module, participants will be able to:

- Classify and discuss the meteorological variables that are affected by climate change.
- Describe the impacts of changing climatic conditions on human health via evidence-based causal pathways with an emphasis on identification of vulnerable communities and patients.
- Identify specific impacts on vulnerable individuals and communities and changes in clinical practice that may prevent or buffer adverse health outcomes.
- Identify specific impacts on vulnerable individuals and communities and changes in public health practice and health care systems that may prevent or buffer adverse health outcomes.
- Describe the health co-benefits of climate change mitigation and strategies to engage patients and communities in making health-protective changes.
- Locate local, state or regional data related to climate and access relevant resources to implement local adaptation and mitigation plans.
Educational Philosophy
This module follows the 5E instructional model [Engage, Explore, Explain, Elaborate, Evaluate] to promote participants’ discovery and learning about the complex interactions between climate change, the environment and human health. The philosophy of the model draws on participants existing knowledge, beliefs and skills while guiding participants to ‘direct their own explorations’ through exploration of data and interactive materials. The estimated instructional time for each portion is listed below.

Instructional Time Needed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instructional Stage</th>
<th>Time (minutes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Engagement</td>
<td>15-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploration</td>
<td>20-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explanation</td>
<td>20-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elaboration</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>Amount of time will vary depending on evaluation option selected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Words and Phrases
- adaptation
- air quality
- climate change
- climate driver
- co-benefit(s)
- drought
- environmental hazard
- exposure pathway
- extreme heat event
- food-related infection
- health intervention
- health outcome
- mitigation
- ozone
- particulate matter
- precipitation
- susceptibility
- systems thinking
- vector-borne infection
- vulnerable populations
- water-related infection
Alignment to Relevant Frameworks

*Climate Literacy*
This module, if successfully completed, addresses four essential principles of climate science as outlined in *Climate Literacy: The Essential Principles of Climate Science.*

This module also contributes to a number of worldwide efforts to increase climate and health education including:

- **United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)**
  "Universities, tertiary centres and research centres have a special role to play in educating and building the capacity of stakeholders in key sectors, and climate change and adaptation issues should be integrated into education curricula."

- **UNFCCC Paris Agreement**
  “Parties under the Paris Agreement shall cooperate in taking measures, as appropriate, to enhance climate change education, training, public awareness, public participation and public access to information, recognizing the importance of these steps with respect to enhancing climate change actions.”

- **World Medical Association Declaration of Delhi on Health and Climate Change**
  Urges National Medical Associations and their members to “become educated as to the health effects of climate change and be prepared to treat and manage them in individuals.”

- **World Health Organization’s Regional Office for Europe Report**
  *Protecting Health in Europe from Climate Change* notes that “Health professionals have the expertise, opportunity and often – through advocacy and direct participation – the political leverage that can help ensure that adaptive and preventive action is taken. Health professionals can promote strategies for adaptation and mitigation efforts through public education, especially in settings such as doctors’ waiting rooms and hospital clinics.”

- **This training module helps advance the goals outlined by the International Federation of Medical Students’ Associations (IFMSA)** statement that, medical students, medical practitioners, healthcare providers and organizations representing the interests of current and future health professionals should:
  1. Take the lead in educating the public on the likely effects of climate change on health, as well as directly lobbying key stakeholders including governments, to take action on the issue.
  2. Reduce carbon emissions from the healthcare sector.
  3. Integrate climate change and its threat to health within the curricula of medical schools worldwide and into capacity building programs targeting health professionals from a multidisciplinary approach.
  4. Further continue the initiative of the WHO Country profiles on climate and health, in collaboration between NMOs, governments and WHO.
Series Information

This document is part of a series of educational models on climate and health. Additional versions in the series include:

- A Student Exploration of the Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health in the United States
- A Student Exploration of the Global Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health
- A Public Health Student Exploration of the Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health in the United States
- A Clinical Health Care Student Exploration of the Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health in the United States
- A Student Exploration of the Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health & Vector-borne Disease

The original version of the educational materials for United States high school students was prepared by Dana Brown Haine, MS, University of North Carolina, under temporary assignment to NIEHS through the Intergovernmental Personnel Act (IPA) Mobility Program. Additional versions for international, clinical and public health students were developed by Juliana Betbeze, Leann Kuehn, Betsy Galluzzo, Kimberly Hill, Cecilia Sorensen, and Mariana Surillo. Dr. Sorensen also provided the case studies accompanying the educational materials for graduate and professional students. Materials were generously reviewed by educators and professionals around the country.

Editorial and publication support was provided by MDB, Inc. under contract number 273201600006I from the National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences (NIEHS).
At-a-glance Summary
This module follows the 5E instructional model to promote participant discovery and learning about the complex interactions between climate change, the environment and human health. The 5E model is based on the following steps: engage, explore, explain, elaborate, and evaluate. Students will build on existing knowledge and develop new ideas as they progress through the module.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Engage</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants are prompted to consider the human health impacts of climate driven changes in temperature and precipitation, specifically in regard to their patient populations and healthcare systems. Data visualizations are used to facilitate student engagement and to help the teacher informally assess participants’ pre-existing knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Explore</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants are assigned a reading from the resources on a particular climate effect (e.g., extreme heat) and create a visual model that depicts the climate change (driver), exposure pathway(s) and health outcomes. Participants consider their patient populations and the populations relevant to their specialty or discipline. Participants can also be tasked with exploring data at a local, regional, or national level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Explain</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using knowledge gained in section 2 (explore) participants work in small groups or as a class to create and present a visual model to convey the complex ways that climate change affects health. The facilitator’s actions center on ensuring participant explanations are accurate, addressing misinformation, and clarifying points of confusion. Facilitator introduces systems thinking and emphasizes interactions of Earth’s spheres and ecosystems. Participants read “clinical case studies” for their climate driver and share examples from their personal knowledge and experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Elaborate</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitator introduces concept that climate change mitigation strategies confer co-benefits to human health and concept that adaptation strategies reduce negative health impacts. Participants identify specific impacts on vulnerable individuals and communities and explore changes in clinical practice OR public health practice that could be advanced to may prevent adverse outcomes within the focus of their assigned topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluation (Assessment Strategies)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical medicine:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Option 1:</strong> Task participants with writing a clinical practice guideline with 2-3 recommendations that safeguard the health of vulnerable populations in relationship to a specific exposure pathway.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Option 2:</strong> Task participants with choosing a vulnerable population, identifying all climate-related health risks and creating key statements to share with patients along with actions that patients can take to safeguard their health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Option 3:</strong> Task participants with designing a public health intervention to combat a specific health outcome that is relevant to their local community, patient population, state or region of the country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Extend</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants could extend their learning by either working to implement a resilience project in their community or by advocating for their adaptation strategy or project through civic engagement with policymakers and stakeholders. Note to facilitators: regional/community specific applications are needed here.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Background
Much of the discussion around climate change has focused on the physical and chemical aspects and resulting environmental effects, such as extreme temperatures and melting glaciers. More recently, the discussion has expanded to include impacts on human health. For instance, the *IPCC Fifth Assessment Report*, Chapter 11 “Human Health: Impacts, Adaptations, and Co-Benefits”, significantly advances what we know about the impacts of climate change on human health. As the climate continues to change, the risks to human health will grow, exacerbating existing health threats and creating new public health challenges worldwide. Depending on the specific health threat, vulnerable populations may include children, pregnant women, the elderly, outdoor workers, low income groups, some communities of color, indigenous peoples, immigrants, persons with disabilities and persons with pre-existing or chronic medical conditions. As the public health system attempts to mitigate the negative health consequences of climate change, it will be important to take vulnerable populations into account locally, regionally and globally.

There are six categories of human health impacts as identified by the *IPCC Fifth Assessment Report*, Chapter 11 “Human Health Impacts, Adaptations, and Co-Benefits”, including temperature and radiation-related impacts, air quality impacts, extreme events, vector-borne disease and other infectious diseases, food and water borne diseases, mental health, violence and conflict, nutrition, and occupational health. As participants consider the numerous health effects of a changing climate, it is important that they also be tasked with identifying links to clinical or public health practice and adaptation and mitigation strategies that can be implemented to protect human health with respect to climate change.

**Mitigation strategies** can reduce CO2 added to the atmosphere. These strategies include increased use of renewable energy sources, such as solar and wind power. Current mitigation strategies will not be able to reverse the change in climate that has already occurred but can reduce future impacts. **Adaptation strategies** help minimize the negative impacts of climate change. An example of an adaptation strategy is a heat wave early warning system that helps protects vulnerable populations from the health effects of heat waves.

Through these changes in societal and public health practices, we may be able to limit the magnitude of changes to the planet’s climate and thus reduce the negative impacts to human health. Many strategies will provide **co-benefits**, simultaneously reducing the negative effects of climate change while also reducing illness and death. An example of adaptation strategies that provide health benefits, include resilience of health care facilities, integrated early warning and vector control systems for infectious diseases, and enhanced waste water treatment facilities to manage increased flooding events. However, it is also possible that some mitigation may introduce unanticipated potential for human harm.
Facilitator Preparation

1. Participants should be introduced to the general concept of climate change and to the human activities influencing greenhouse gas emissions prior to or at the start of this module. This module is appropriate for professional students in health-related fields (public health, medicine, nursing) and can be used to enhance curricular and core competency objectives (see Alignment to Relevant Frameworks section above) including: application of epidemiologic and environmental evidence to clinical practice and understanding the population-level determinants of health on the health status and health care of individuals and populations. This module is also appropriate for professionals in the setting of a journal-club style or focus-group setting.

2. Read the Top-Level Findings and Chapter 11 of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change’s (IPCC) Fifth Assessment Report, the World Health Organization’s Climate and Health Global Overview, and decide whether you want to cover all categories of climate impacts on health. Chapter 11 covers specific examples of climate impacts on human health and can be useful as you plan your instruction. Notice the diagram on page 716 demonstrates three primary exposure pathways by which climate change affects health, including directly through weather variables, indirectly through natural systems, and pathways heavily mediated through human systems. Another resource available is The Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health in the United States: A Scientific Assessment (called the 2016 Climate and Health Assessment) an evidence-based analysis which describes seven categories of human health impacts (chapters 2-8). The table provided on page 5 of the Executive Summary shows specific examples of climate impacts on human health and can be useful as you plan your instruction. The 2016 report builds upon the chapter on human health in the 2014 National Climate Assessment, and provides a foundation for the health chapter in the recent 2018 National Climate Assessment.

3. Decide whether participants should read only their chapters of the IPCC Chapter 11 or specific sections of the CHA, or both.

4. You will assign one group of participants for each impact you have chosen; determine how many participants will be in each group and provide one copy of the reading for each participant. The readings will need to be downloaded as pdfs or by clicking on the relevant hyperlinks.

IPCC Fifth Assessment Report, Working Group II Top Level Findings
WHO, Climate and Health Global Overview

Depending on your instructional goals and/or the amount of time dedicated to participant reading, you may choose to have participants also read IPCC Fifth Assessment Report, Working Group II, Chapter 11. Human Health: Impacts, Adaptations, and Co-Benefits. Facilitators interested in learning more before preparing the lesson may find resources in the appendix and additional examples in the Clinical Case Studies.

5. Prepare for the Step 6 of Engagement Activity by visiting the IPCC Data Distribution Centre (see Resources section) and observing predictions for your region. Here you will have access
to temperature and precipitation data spanning from 1910 to present day (actual data) and predictions through 2100, for which you can invite participants to consider human health impacts under the different greenhouse emissions scenarios of the IPCC reports, past and current. A default data visualization related to extreme precipitation is provided on Facilitator PPT slide 4 to accompany the cause-effect model on flooding presented on slide 7, demonstrating future global changes in flood frequency. If you choose to use a different visualization, replace the content on slide 4 with your selected visualization and modify the cause-effect model on slide 7 if needed (see Supplemental materials).

To identify other relevant climate-sensitive health outcomes for your country or region the following resources may be useful:

- **Health and Climate Assessment Country Profiles**: fact sheets from the WHO that include a section on human health at a country-specific level.
- **UNDP Climate Change Country Profiles**: includes maps and diagrams demonstrating the observed and projected climates in 61 countries.
- **The Regional Chapters from Working Group II IPCC’s Fifth Assessment Report**
  - Chapter 22: Africa
  - Chapter 23: Europe
  - Chapter 24: Asia
  - Chapter 25: Australasia
  - Chapter 26: North America
  - Chapter 27: Central and South America
  - Chapter 28: Polar Regions
  - Chapter 29: Small Islands
  - Chapter 30: The Ocean

6. Familiarize yourself with this entire lesson plan; review the accompanying PowerPoint slide set and update if needed to tailor it to your instructional goals and/or your region.

7. Assemble required materials (see Materials section below).

8. Prepare a section of the room for participants to display and organize their visual model of how climate change impacts human health. This section of the room should include a whiteboard (recommended), chalkboard, or blank wall.

   a. Write the following headings on signs that could be a piece of colored paper, or, if using a white board or chalk board, colored markers or colored chalk, respectively, can be used instead of colored paper. Place the signs on the wall/pace in this order from left to right: Climate Driver (green); Exposure Pathway (blue); Health Outcome (red). These signs will guide participants as they place their work on the wall in these categories (also see photo on page 11).

---

Explore More: Case Studies for Students and Health Professionals

In addition to the examples throughout this text, a graduate level supplement featuring detailed clinical care and public health case studies of climate and health impacts is available here.

Before starting a lesson, instructors are encouraged to explore the case studies and select those that best apply to the field of expertise for your audience. Alternatively, students can explore case studies on their own.
Materials *(Note: these materials may be substituted as needed depending on resources)*

- Computer with MS Office Software (including PowerPoint)
- PowerPoint slide set that accompanies this module *(see Supplemental materials)*
- Projector

Engagement

- PowerPoint slide set
- [Optional] Blank index cards

Exploration

- Print copies of the graphic organizer “worksheet” *(provided on page 14)*, one per participant
- [Optional] Colored highlighters or colored pencils (green, orange, blue, red) for reading
- Print one copy of the selected reading for each participant. The ½ page chapter summaries are included in supplemental materials while the other readings will need to be downloaded as pdfs.

Top Level Findings, Working Group II, Fifth Assessment Report, IPCC

- [Report](#)

*WHO UNFCCC, Climate and Health Global Overview*

*Climate and Health Country Profiles*

*The Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health in the United States*

*A Scientific Assessment Executive Summary*

*IPCC Fifth Assessment Report, Working Group II, Chapter 11.*

*Human Health: Impacts, Adaptations, and Co-Benefits*

*Summary for Policymakers in Other Languages: [English](#), [Arabic](#) [Chinese](#), [French](#), [Russian](#), [Spanish](#), [Czech](#), [German](#), [Japanese](#), [Korean](#), [Portuguese](#), [Swedish](#)*

Explanation

- Colored dry erase markers if using whiteboard for display of visual model
- Colored chalk if using chalkboard for display of visual model
- If using blank wall for display of visual model:
  - Colored (green, blue, red/orange) ¼ sheets of paper, index cards or Post-it notes
  - Masking tape to attach the colored paper to the wall (if not using Post-it notes) and for showing connections between items on the visual model
- [Optional] 1 copy (per participant in the group) of blank systems diagram *(see PPT slide 14)*
- Print one copy of the corresponding “clinical case studies” for each topic for each participant in each group.

Elaboration

- No special materials aside from PowerPoint slide set are needed for this activity.

Evaluation

- [Optional] Computers with internet access, one per participant or participant group.
**Procedure**

**Engagement**

*This short exercise is intended to quickly and informally assess participants’ pre-existing knowledge of how climate impacts human health and pique their interest in expanding their knowledge. The use of national and/or regional data visualizations provides relevance to participants’ lives. This activity also introduces participants to the terminology that will be used in the exploration and explanation phases of this module.*

**Part I | Exploring prior knowledge**

1. Draw a “T” chart on the board or large easel; label the left-hand column of the chart “examples of climatic change” and label the right-hand column “human health effects.”

2. Ask participants to name specific examples of climatic change (e.g., increased air temperature) to assess their pre-existing content knowledge. This query invites participants to list specific ways the climate is changing (temperature, precipitation, extreme weather, etc.). Record their responses in the left-hand column of the T chart; do not worry about right or wrong answers, just record participants’ answers.

3. Project figures from the IPCC Data Distribution Centre that depict observed changes in temperature and precipitation for your nation (Facilitator PPT slides 2 and 3). Alternatively, you may choose to project visualizations from the entire globe through NOAA’s Global Temperature and Precipitation Maps online tool (see Resources section).

4. As a class, interpret each figure noting regions that are becoming cooler/warmer and drier/wetter and discuss the observed climate changes for your state and region of the country. Alternatively, participants could be asked to interpret each figure in writing or aloud with a partner.

5. Next, ask participants to list specific impact(s) of 1) a warming climate on human health; 2) a wetter climate on human health; and 3) a drier climate on human health. Record their responses in the right-hand column of the T chart aligned with any relevant climatic changes listed in the left-hand column; do not worry about right or wrong answers, just record participants’ answers.
Part II | Creating a visual model of cause and effect

6. Project slide 4 of the data visualization you selected in step 5 of the Facilitator Preparation Section to the class and ask participants to observe and interpret the visualization either individually or with a partner. If referencing a current event (e.g., a recent flooding), adding one or more photos will enhance the relevance of this topic.

7. As a class, summarize the data visualization and tell the participants that the class is going to construct a visual model to show the connection between a specific climate change (default example: heavy precipitation) and a specific human health effect (default example: water contamination). This modeling activity will introduce participants to the terminology that will be used in the exploration and explanation phases of this module.

8. In order to create this visual model, use the template provided on slide 5 as a prompt as you ask participants to respond to the following questions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Flooding &amp; Human Health</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the <strong>climate driver</strong>, also called specific climate change, which is referenced by this data visualization?</td>
<td><strong>Heavy precipitation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is/are the <strong>environmental condition(s)</strong> that arise in response to this specific climate change? <strong>These conditions can either create(s) or exacerbate(s) an environmental hazard.</strong></td>
<td><strong>Flooding</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the <strong>environmental hazard</strong> being examined? <strong>An environmental hazard is what will directly lead to a negative health outcome. Together, the environmental condition(s) and the hazard(s) comprise the exposure pathway.</strong></td>
<td><strong>Exposure to contaminated floodwaters</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is/are the <strong>health effect(s)</strong> that might arise from exposure to the environmental hazard?</td>
<td><strong>Water-borne illness</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Reminder: Use the Clinical Case Studies for supplemental information on flooding and human health. The supplemental document includes a case study of Tropical Storm Erika, health related exposures from heavy precipitation, and environmental contamination after a flood.*

9. Together, this information can be used by the class to construct a visual model of this cause-effect mechanism using the template provided (see slides 5-7).
10. Point out to participants that flooding can be both an environmental condition and a hazard if high waters leads to an injury or drowning. Ask participants if they can think of other human health hazards that might arise from flooding (e.g., growth of mold and mildew after water subsides; affecting current access to healthcare facilities). *Slide 15* shows other hazards that can arise from flooding.

**Teaching tip**
To help participants distinguish between an environmental condition(s) and hazard, provide some familiar examples that might arise as a result of thunderstorm:

**Environmental condition:** Heavy rain and flooding → **Hazard:** Slippery roads, contaminated water

**Environmental condition:** High winds → **Hazard:** Downed trees and power lines, power outages

11. To conclude this engagement activity, tell the participants that they are going to work as a class to create a visual model of the various health outcomes arising from climate change as described in the provided readings using the same strategy.

**Exploration**
1. For each chapter of the assessment you plan to investigate, assign 1-4 participants per chapter and distribute copies of the assigned reading to each group member (sections from Chapter 11 IPCC’s Fifth Assessment Report or CHA chapters and corresponding clinical case studies). You may assign additional readings, such as the WHO’s Climate and Health Global Overview.

IPCC Chapter 11 includes:
- Temperature, storm and radiation-related impacts
  - Chapter 11 Sections 4.1 – 4.3
- Vector-borne and other infectious diseases
  - Chapter 11 Section 5.1
- Food and water-borne diseases
  - Chapter 11 Section 5.2
- Air quality
  - Chapter 11 Section 5.3
- Nutrition and occupational health
  - Chapter 11 Sections 6.1 – 6.2
Educational Materials
A Clinical Health Care Student Exploration of the
Global Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health

- Mental health and violence/conflict
  - Chapter 11 Sections 6.3 – 6.4

2. Ask participants to complete their reading assignment and either individually or in their group complete one or more rows of the graphic organizer provided on page 15 to summarize the climate and health impacts and vulnerable populations identified in their reading.

3. Next, task participants will complete one or more rows of their graphic organizer. To complete a row, participants list the specific health effects for each hazard identified. Then, ask participants to list any vulnerable populations that are more susceptible to experiencing negative health outcomes in reaction to the cited hazard. Also, think about the clinical implications of the health threat (clinical medicine students/practitioners).

4. Depending on your instructional goals, participants could be tasked with conducting additional research on their assigned chapter to investigate this topic from a local or regional perspective.

5. Tell each group that during the next phase of the activity (explanation phase), they will present their visual models to the class (some groups may have more than one model to present). Each group should identify one participant who will present the model(s) aloud to the class while the other participants in the group contribute to the model by writing and/or placing their model components on the board/wall.
As you read, identify the environmental condition(s) that produce the environmental hazard(s) cited and then identify the underlying climate driver(s) (e.g., increased precipitation). For each hazard, list the health effect(s) and the most vulnerable people/groups. **Not all rows may need to be completed.**
Explanation

During this activity, participants have the opportunity to explain their visual model(s) to the class as a larger model is being constructed that will convey the complex climate and health system. The facilitator’s actions center on ensuring participant explanations are accurate, addressing misinformation, and clarifying points of confusion. During the debrief, the facilitator introduces systems thinking and emphasizes interactions of Earth’s spheres (atmosphere, biosphere, hydrosphere, lithosphere).

1. Tell the class they are going to combine their models to create a larger visual model to illustrate the complexity of the climate and health system. One at a time, invite each group to come to the board/wall space you have identified and describe their visual model(s) aloud for each health outcome identified in their chapter as they place their model on the board/wall. For each health outcome identified, participants should also mention any vulnerable populations to the class and how this outcome could relate to their patient populations
   a. Participants will either write their words on the board or place their post-it notes/cards in the appropriate location and connect the words using a marker, chalk or tape.
   b. Participants should note where one environmental condition (e.g. flooding) influences other health outcomes by adding arrows to the model. They should also mention whether the conditions and health outcomes are exacerbating current conditions.
   c. If a change in climate or environmental condition is already represented on the board/wall, participants should use the term that is already there and connect that term to the new information they are adding to the board.
   d. As a facilitator, prompt participants to consider the terms that have already been placed on the board and make new connections using markers or even new terms when possible. For example: Drought will not only cause an increase in wildfires but can also lead to crop failures resulting in a shortage of food, higher food prices and a likely increase in cases of malnutrition and hunger.

Teaching tip
Ask participants to fill in a blank copy of the systems diagram provided on PPT slide 12 (1 copy per participant) to stay on task while others are presenting.

2. As the facilitator, it is important to check if the climate driver, environmental condition, environmental hazard, health outcome sequence identified is correct/logical and clearly depicted on the wall before inviting the next group to the board/wall.

3. Participants will begin to see overlapping themes from the placement of the cards and connecting arrows. For example, flooding results in more than one environmental hazard (see slide 15) which, in turn, results in several potential health effects.
4. The visual model created by the entire class might look chaotic, but it gives students an opportunity to see, both visually and intellectually, the complexity of the interactions between the environment and human health. They can see that one event leading to a change in climate (an increase in temperature) can result in many different environmental conditions (increase in heat index, longer growing season, warmer water temperatures) which in turn can generate many different environmental hazards (prolonged exposure to heat, longer pollen season, rapid development of mosquito vectors) which in turn can result in many different potential health effects (heat related morbidity and mortality, increased incidence of asthma and allergies, and vector-borne diseases). It is a complex system. NOTE: A systems diagram is provided for the teacher’s reference showing these connections - see PPT slide 16.

Systems-thinking

The goal of this activity is to create a visual representation of a complex system from the simple “cause-effect” models each group constructed. By building the larger model and answering the guiding questions provided below, participants will begin to see the complex interconnected nature of our environment and its impact on human health, as well as the need to simplify in order to study and better understand the individual aspects of the system as well as their connections to each other.

5. Introduce systems thinking by asking the following questions:
   • Are there any smaller (sub) systems within the climate-health system?

   Yes, each sphere represents a system, including the atmosphere, biosphere, hydrosphere, and lithosphere. Together, the systems make up the larger climate and health system. The human body is also a relevant system, and this is a good opportunity to emphasize that for each health outcome some individuals are going to be more vulnerable to climate impacts than others. Susceptibility can be influenced by factors such as age, genetic make-up, and socio-economic status. Chapter 9 of the 2016 Climate and Health assessment provides more information on vulnerable populations with key findings that 1) vulnerability varies over time and is place-specific; 2) health impacts vary with age and life stage; 3) social determinants of health interact with climate factors to affect
health risks.

- Ask providers to consider physiological cascades relevant to their specialty and how that compares to the complexity of climate change systems:
  For example, consider heat-related impacts on human physiology, impacts of poor air quality on respiratory health (asthma, COPD), impacts of poor water quality and food borne disease on immunocompromised individuals.

- What is the value of a systems thinking approach to understanding the impact of climate on human health? (e.g., how does knowing about the bigger system help with the study of a smaller system, in this case the human body?)
  Participant answers may vary. Answers may include statements such as it helps identify potential variables/influences on the system; if you are not aware of the larger system you may reach erroneous conclusions or encounter unintended consequences.

6. Refer to the visual model depicted on the classroom wall and ask participants to consider the environmental condition for a single climate impact such as flooding (also see slide 15) and all of the potential health effects associated with it. As the facilitator, you may choose to use a different colored marker or tape to denote the numerous health effects that can arise as a result of a single health threat such as flooding.

7. Prompt providers to consider the complexities of addressing their patients’ needs in light of impacts of climate change that extend beyond their specialty areas.
  Answers will vary, but possibly be along the lines of existing conditions being exacerbated by changing meteorological conditions; patients may present multifactorial health concerns ranging across specialties and health services – Further address this conversation by discussing providers practicing dynamic care; And how do you as a provider and your patients fit into the larger health care system

8. Reiterate that the climate and health system is inherently complex. To better understand the system and assess how climate change is impacting human health, it is essential to study its component parts while keeping interconnections in mind. The way scientists think about these interconnections is through the concept of a “system.” But scientists and policy-makers also need to consider other systems connected to their system of interest as they advocate for strategies that are protective of human health. For example, there is a push for use of biofuels to reduce our reliance on non-renewable petroleum-based sources. Doing that would solve one set of problems like oil spills and increasing independence from foreign oil, but it may introduce another set of problems in an interconnected system, such as using a food source as a fuel when the world’s population is increasing or the emissions from that alternative fuel may still contribute to air pollution or climate change. These interconnections will be explored further in the next activity.

9. To conclude this section, have each group reflect upon the clinical case studies associated with their climate driver. Invite participants to discuss and share other examples of correlates they have encountered in their practice environments.
Elaboration
During this solutions-focused activity, participants elaborate on the concepts they have learned and make connections to other related concepts; this activity also promotes critical thinking by asking the participants to evaluate solutions.

1. Reinforce to participants that greenhouse gas emissions resulting from human activities are driving the climatic changes described in this module. Introduce participants to the concept of climate mitigation (taking action to reduce or prevent the emissions of greenhouse gases) and prompt participants to consider the health co-benefits that are conferred by such actions. For example, implementing renewable energy technologies means fewer greenhouse gas emissions and reduced emissions of particulate matter, thus improving air quality, which will translate into overall improved cardiopulmonary health. This improved health outcome is an example of a health co-benefit. It should also be emphasized that these health co-benefits may have maximum impact on already vulnerable populations (e.g. those with asthma). Introduce the concept of adaptation to prevent current and future climate change impacts, such as those from more severe storms. You may display slides 18-23.

2. Task participants with considering how climate mitigation will impact the health outcomes described in their assigned reading. What are the relevant health co-benefits?

3. To further bring a solutions focus to this module, tell participants they will identify changes to clinical or public health practice that could be advanced to either prevent or manage the negative health outcome(s) that were the focus of their assigned reading. These solutions can be thought of as adaptation strategies. A list of possible adaptation strategies is included for each chapter in the Answer Key (Page 24-28).

4. For their assigned chapter, task participants with identifying adaptation strategies in the practice of clinical medicine to:
   a. Prevent the negative health outcome(s) from occurring in a changing climate; and/or
   b. Promote preparedness/adaptation so that the negative health outcomes are less severe or occur to a lesser extent than without the intervention.

5. Participants could also be asked to investigate local adaptation strategies that are either being planned or implemented to address any health outcomes mentioned in their assigned chapter.

Teaching Tip
Participants may find that some strategies could be both a mitigation strategy and an adaptation strategy. For example, an urban forest can reduce greenhouse emissions (mitigation) and it can improve air quality (adaptation).

6. For each adaptation strategy identified have participants evaluate the pros and cons of implementation. Some adaptation strategies may counter mitigation efforts! For example, building an urban cooling center for people to go to on extreme heat days will be associated with increased greenhouse gas emissions unless the center is powered by renewable energy.

7. Next, invite each group to share one or more of the adaptation strategies they identified to the class.
Evaluation

During this phase, participants demonstrate what they have learned by extending their knowledge and practicing their science communication skills.

Depending on background of the participants (clinical medicine or public health) and the amount of time devoted to assessment of participant learning, a range of evaluation options is provided.

**Option 1: Clinical Medicine:** Task participants with writing a clinical practice guideline with 2-3 recommendations that safeguard the health of vulnerable populations in relationship to a specific climate driver. These recommendations should be appropriate to share within the practice environment, with colleagues, with hospital administrators or with relevant policy makers at the local, state or regional level.

**Option 2: Clinical Medicine:** Task participants with choosing a vulnerable population (e.g. elderly, children, psychiatrically ill) and identifying all climate-related health risks. Next, create key statements that could be shared with a patient of that demographic regarding climate change and their particular risks. Then, create a list of actions that patients can take to safeguard their health in respect to the risks identified.

**Option 3: Clinical Medicine:** Task participants with designing a health intervention to combat a specific health outcome that is relevant to their local community, patient population, state or region of the country. Their design could be described in writing or through a schematic drawing/diagram or they could design a physical prototype through creative reuse of household materials. Participants present their design to the class which could be accompanied by a brochure or fact sheet.

Extend

Participants could further extend their learning by either working to implement their evaluation project in their community (hospital, university, town/state/region or clinical practice) or by advocating for their adaptation strategy or resilience building project through civic engagement with relevant stakeholders.
Resources


Online resources
CDC Social Vulnerability Index: http://svi.cdc.gov/

NASA Global Climate Change: Vital Signs of the Planet https://climate.nasa.gov/


Using Media to Enhance Teaching and Learning: What is a model? https://serc.carleton.edu/introgeo/models/WhatsAModel.html

US Climate Resilience Toolkit | Climate Explorer (Explore maps and graphs of historical and projected climate trends in your local area by entering your zip code. https://crt-climate-explorer.nemac.org/

US Climate Resilience Toolkit https://toolkit.climate.gov/
What Climate Change Means for Your State | Fact Sheets from the EPA

WHO UNFCCC Climate and Health Country Profile Project:
http://www.who.int/globalchange/resources/countries/en/

**Multimedia**

Feeling the Effects of Climate Change, PBS video (13-minute video)
http://video.pbs.org/video/1939995285

Healthy Futures and QWeCl: Health and Climate Change in Africa
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oYL4Nc-qnKE

National Climate Assessment: Health chapter (aprx 2-minute video)
https://vimeo.com/92569617

Protecting Public Health From Climate-Related Threats: From Science to Practice in the United States,
Climate Reality Project
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OtWRw6jE3d0

World Health Organization: Climate and Health
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HC8eG05ceIs
### Topic | Graphic Organizer for Reading Comprehension Answer

**Answer KEY**

**Topic | Temperature-related Death and Illness**  
**Extreme Heat**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>↑ air temperature</td>
<td>elevated air temperatures</td>
<td>prolonged exposure to extreme heat</td>
<td>heat-related illness and death, including heat cramps, heat exhaustion, heatstroke, and hyperthermia; dehydration; exacerbation of respiratory, cardiac and other illnesses associated with extreme heat; potential decrease in cold-related deaths, including hypothermia and frostbite</td>
<td>children and the elderly; economically disadvantaged groups; chronically ill; outdoor workers and athletes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>more frequent, elevated air temperature</td>
<td>combined impact of temperature, humidity, wind, &amp; sunlight</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prolonged heat waves</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>seasonal timing of events</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Possible patient centered adaptation strategies:** stay hydrated, be aware of heat advisories and adjust work/play time outdoors, etc. Participants may be prompted to identify adaptive behaviors for their specific patient populations or their communities.
Answer KEY

**Topic | Air Quality Impacts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature changes in precipitation</td>
<td>longer growing seasons</td>
<td>longer pollen season</td>
<td>↑ allergies/asthma timing, frequency, severity</td>
<td>children and elderly; asthmatics and people whose immune systems are compromised economically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature ↓ humidity</td>
<td>↑ air temperature + UV radiation ↓ cloud cover and rainfall</td>
<td>↑ ground-level ozone</td>
<td>↑ cardiac effort, impairs pulmonary gas exchange, acute myocardial infarction, premature deaths, hospital visits, lost school and work days, acute respiratory symptoms, lung inflammation &amp; scar tissue, chest pain, coughing, throat irritation, congestion, bronchitis, emphysema, asthma</td>
<td>children and elderly; asthmatics and people whose immune systems are compromised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature ↓ rain or snow</td>
<td>Drought wildfires</td>
<td>dust particulate matter smoke</td>
<td>respiratory symptoms, allergies, lung damage, premature death, adverse chronic and acute cardiovascular and respiratory health outcomes</td>
<td>children and elderly; asthmatics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ heavy precipitation and severe weather events ↑ humidity</td>
<td>↑ indoor humidity and dampness</td>
<td>↑ indoor mold, dust mites, bacteria, and other bio-contamination indoors ↑ indoor volatile organic compounds (VOCs)</td>
<td>asthma and allergy exacerbation</td>
<td>children and elderly; asthmatics and people whose immune systems are compromised</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Possible patient centered adaptation strategies: limit outdoor exercise near roadways, increase distance from high-traffic roadways, educate self and family about asthma/allergies, reduce personal carbon emissions.
### Answer KEY

**Topic | Extreme Events**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>↑ precipitation</td>
<td>flooding</td>
<td>traumatic injury and death; drowning; mental health impacts; carbon monoxide poisoning related to power outages; hospitalization; famine; poor water quality; displacement; gastrointestinal illness</td>
<td>coastal populations; persons with disabilities; certain racial/ethnic minority groups; pregnant women and children; low income populations; persons with limited English proficiency</td>
<td>↑ in prevalence of water-borne GI illness and increase demand for resources needed to treat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature</td>
<td>extreme weather events: hurricanes, tornadoes, severe thunderstorms</td>
<td>wind, flooding, storm surge, power outages</td>
<td>damaged structures can injure or kill people; displacement from homes and/or businesses</td>
<td>pregnant women and children; persons with disabilities; elderly; low income populations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature</td>
<td>drought</td>
<td>wildfires (smoke); decrease in potable water supplies; decrease in water supplies for agriculture</td>
<td>smoke inhalation; burns; asthma exacerbation; mental health impacts; dehydration; famine; illness from reduced water quality and quantity</td>
<td>asthmatics; low income populations; certain populations of color; pregnant women and children; elderly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↓ precipitation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>loss/damage to health care infrastructure, including hospitals/rehab facilities and more</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Possible patient centered adaptation strategies:** respond to evacuation orders and other emergency warnings, pack an emergency preparedness kit or “Go Bag” and develop a family communication plan in advance of extreme events.
**Answer KEY**

**Topic | Vector-Borne Diseases**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>changes in extreme high and low temperatures</td>
<td>geographic range of disease vectors increases</td>
<td>spread of vector-borne and zoonotic diseases (e.g. malaria occurring at higher elevations)</td>
<td>persons in close proximity to vector habitat; persons with outdoor occupations; children ages 5-9 and adults ages 55-59; males</td>
<td>clinicians must maintain high index of suspicion for atypical pathogens presenting outside of traditional ranges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature and changes in precipitation patterns</td>
<td>↑ vector populations</td>
<td>spread of malaria, dengue, and other pathogens</td>
<td>persons in close proximity to vector habitat; persons with outdoor occupations; low socioeconomic groups</td>
<td>↑ in need for testing among hospital and reference labs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extreme events and flooding</td>
<td>↑ vector populations</td>
<td>spread of mosquito borne diseases and leptospirosis</td>
<td>persons in close proximity to vector habitat; persons with outdoor occupations; low socioeconomic groups</td>
<td>↑ in need for specialty consultation with infectious disease experts Increased need for clinical education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>altered weather patterns</td>
<td>drought</td>
<td>↓ some vector populations (e.g. mosquitoes require water)</td>
<td>↓ in some vector-borne diseases in some areas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature</td>
<td>Longer growing season; ↑ pests/vectors;</td>
<td>↑ use of pesticides</td>
<td>neurological diseases, cancer, developmental effects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>outdoor occupations; low socioeconomic groups; children, pregnant women, and elderly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Possible patient centered adaptation strategies:** wear bug repellent, cover skin when outside during peak times, check for pests potentially carrying vector-borne diseases after prolonged time outdoors, make use of screens on windows and doors (barriers) and air conditioning to limit exposure to vector-borne pathogens; bednets; remove standing water. A discussion of strategies being implemented to reduce exposure to the Zika virus would be timely as participants may have heard strategies for people living in and traveling to areas with Zika virus transmission.
## Answer KEY

### Topic: Water-Related Infection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>↓ precipitation</td>
<td>drought</td>
<td>↑ concentration of effluent pathogens in wastewater treatment plants</td>
<td>waterborne pathogens</td>
<td>residents of low income rural areas; small community or private groundwater wells</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ extreme precipitation</td>
<td>flooding, freshwater runoff, storm surge, changes to coastal salinity</td>
<td>contaminated water supply (pathogens); compromised quality of recreational waters; ↓ shellfish harvesting</td>
<td>vomiting, diarrhea, wound/skin infections; famine and dehydration; infrastructure failure</td>
<td>tribal groups that consume shellfish; populations that use recreational waters (fishing, swimming, boating); children and pregnant women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ air temperature</td>
<td>↑ water temperature</td>
<td>↑ pathogenic organisms such as diarrhea-causing vibrio bacteria; ↑ growth of toxic algal blooms; ↑ seafood-related poisonings (e.g. ciguatera)</td>
<td>diarrhea; neurotoxic or respiratory effects from toxic algae</td>
<td>beach goers; remote populations or villages; residents of low income rural areas; children and pregnant women</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Possible patient centered adaptation strategies:

Awareness about raw shellfish consumption and recreating in marine waters with open wounds, informed recreational activities, education of social determinates of health that affect immune status.
## Answer KEY

**Topic | Food Safety and Nutritional Quality**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>altered weather patterns, ↑ temperatures</td>
<td>↑ temperatures and flooding</td>
<td>bacterial pathogens (e.g. salmonella); food spoilage and contamination; disrupted distribution</td>
<td>↑ illness from pathogens that cause vomiting and diarrhea which can result in decreased nutrients in the body; famine</td>
<td>low socioeconomic groups; children, elderly, and pregnant women; indigenous populations; persons with weakened immune systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ co2 levels</td>
<td>direct co2 fertilization effect on plant photosynthesis</td>
<td>Stimulate growth and carbohydrate production in some plants = lower levels of protein and essential minerals</td>
<td>negative implications on human dietary nutrition</td>
<td>pregnant women, elderly, and children; persons with weakened immune systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ air temperature</td>
<td>↑ ocean temperature</td>
<td>accumulation of mercury in seafood; introduce contaminants into the food chain</td>
<td>mercury poisoning; seafood-related gastroenteritis</td>
<td>populations that consume diet high in fish; pregnant women, elderly, and children; persons with weakened immune systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ extreme weather events</td>
<td>↑ co2 concentrations</td>
<td>altered incidence and distribution of pests, parasites, and microbes = ↑ in use of pesticides and veterinary drugs</td>
<td>bioaccumulation of pesticides; resistance to pesticides</td>
<td>agricultural workers; pregnant women, elderly, and children; low socioeconomic groups; persons with weakened immune systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ temperature and drought</td>
<td>stress plants, making them more susceptible to mold growth</td>
<td>↑ mold growth and mycotoxin production</td>
<td>illness and death; impaired development in children and immune suppression</td>
<td>children and pregnant women; persons with weakened immune systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>↑ precipitation and flooding</td>
<td>entry of contaminants into the food chain (e.g. PCBs, organic pollutants, dioxins, pesticides)</td>
<td>illness and death; adverse health effects</td>
<td>children and pregnant women; persons with weakened immune systems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Possible patient centered adaptation strategies:** home refrigeration, awareness of food-handling practices and preparation, wash produce before consumption, awareness of outbreaks.
### Answer KEY

**Topic | Mental Health and Well-Being**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Climate Driver(s)</th>
<th>Exposure pathway</th>
<th>Health Outcome(s)</th>
<th>Vulnerable Populations</th>
<th>Clinical Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>altered weather patterns</td>
<td>extreme weather events (hurricanes, wildfires, flooding)</td>
<td>geographic displacement, damage or loss of property, death or injury of loved ones, recovery efforts</td>
<td>anxiety, emotional stress; acute traumatic stress; post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD); grief; chronic psychological dysfunction; depression, poor concentration, sleep disorders, etc.</td>
<td>children; elderly women (especially pregnant and post-partum women); people with preexisting mental illness; economically disadvantaged and homeless; first responders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>altered weather patterns, temperature changes</td>
<td>extreme temperatures</td>
<td>prolonged heat or cold</td>
<td>chronic stress; poor physical and mental health; increased risk of disease or death</td>
<td>people with preexisting mental illness; elderly populations and people taking prescription medications that impair their body’s ability to regulate temperature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Possible patient centered adaptation strategies:** acknowledge condition and seek help; provide assistance to family and loved ones; psychological counseling.